



City and County of San Francisco  
**Department on the Status of Women**



London N. Breed  
 Mayor

**Family Violence Council Meeting Minutes**  
 November 15, 2023, 3:00 pm – 5:00 pm

**I. Call to Order/Roll Call**

<b>Seat No.</b>	<b>Seat Designation</b>	<b>Member Present</b>
1	Presiding Judge of the Superior Court or designee	
2	Mayor or designee	Ivy Lee
3	President of the Board of Supervisors or designee	Sam Logan
4	District Attorney or designee	Rebecca Wagner
5	Chief of Police or designee	
6	Sheriff or designee	Delia Ginorio
7	President of Commission on the Status of Women or designee	Kimberly Ellis
8	Chief of Adult Probation or designee	Cristel Tullock
9	Executive Director of Department of Emergency Management or designee	Evora Heard
10	Executive Director of Domestic Violence Consortium or designee	Beverly Upton
11	Director of Human Services Agency or designee	Susie Smith
12	Executive Director of Consortium for Elder Abuse Prevention or designee	Ali Chiu
13	Executive Director of Safe & Sound, which operates the San Francisco Child Abuse Prevention Council or designee	Jenny Pearlman
14	Director of the Department of Public Health or designee	Dr. Leigh Kimberg
15	Executive Director of the Department of Adult and Aging Services or designee	Kari Kientzy

16	Executive Director of the Department of Children, Youth & Their Families or designee	Jasmine Dawson
17	Medical Examiner or designee	Christopher Liverman
18	Director of the Department of Child Support Services or designee	Karen Roye
19	Chief of Juvenile Probation or designee	Gabe Calvillo
20	Public Defender or designee	
21	Director of the Department of Animal Care and Control or designee	
22	Superintendent of San Francisco Unified School District or designee	
23	Human Resources Director or designee	
24	Chief of the Fire Department or designee	
25	Director of the Department of Homelessness and Supportive Housing or designee	
26	Director of the Department of Early Childhood or designee	Shelli Rawlings Fein
27	Director of the Department of Police Accountability or designee	
28	Executive Director of the Human Rights Commission or designee	KellyLou Densmore

The meeting was called to order at 3:03PM. Quorum was established with 19 members present.

**II. Consent Agenda/Agenda Changes**

**Action:** To approve the Consent Agenda and any Changes to November 15, 2023 Agenda.

Consent Agenda Items:

- Minutes from the August 16, 2023 meeting
- Family Violence Council 2024 meeting schedule
- November 15, 2023 meeting agenda

<b>Seat No.</b>	<b>Seat Designation</b>	<b>Member Present</b>	<b>Vote</b>
1	Presiding Judge of the Superior Court or designee		
2	Mayor or designee	Ivy Lee	Y
3	President of the Board of Supervisors or designee	Sam Logan	Y
4	District Attorney or designee	Rebecca Wagner	Y
5	Chief of Police or designee		
6	Sheriff or designee	Delia Ginorio	Y
7	President of Commission on the Status of Women or designee	Kimberly Ellis	Y
8	Chief of Adult Probation or designee	Cristel Tullock	Y
9	Executive Director of Department of Emergency Management or designee	Evora Heard	Y
10	Executive Director of Domestic Violence Consortium or designee	Beverly Upton	Y
11	Director of Human Services Agency or designee	Susie Smith	Y
12	Executive Director of Consortium for Elder Abuse Prevention or designee	Ali Chiu	Y
13	Executive Director of Safe & Sound, which operates the San Francisco Child Abuse Prevention Council or designee	Jenny Pearlman	Y
14	Director of the Department of Public Health or designee	Dr. Leigh Kimberg	Y
15	Executive Director of the Department of Adult and Aging Services or designee	Kari Kientzy	Y
16	Executive Director of the Department of Children, Youth & Their Families or designee	Jasmine Dawson	Y
17	Medical Examiner or designee	Christopher Liverman	Y
18	Director of the Department of Child Support Services or designee	Karen Roye	Y

19	Chief of Juvenile Probation or designee	Gabe Calvillo	Y
20	Public Defender or designee		
21	Director of the Department of Animal Care and Control or designee		
22	Superintendent of San Francisco Unified School District or designee		
23	Human Resources Director or designee		
24	Chief of the Fire Department or designee		
25	Director of the Department of Homelessness and Supportive Housing or designee		
26	Director of the Department of Early Childhood or designee	Shellie Rawlings Fein	Y
27	Director of the Department of Police Accountability or designee		
28	Executive Director of the Human Rights Commission or designee	KellyLou Densmore	Y

Ivy Lee made the motion to approve the consent agenda. Cristel Tullock seconded. The consent agenda passed with 19 votes in favor.

### III. Report Out From Elected Officials

Bev Upton asked for an update from the Office of Supervisor Catherine Stefani, in particular an update on the Office of Victim and Witness rights and the Domestic Violence Awareness rally held in October at the City Hall.

Sam Logan requested that the report on the Office of Victim and Witness Rights be provided at the first meeting in 2024. Ms. Logan highlighted the DV rally held on October 24, 2023, the same day that Supervisor Stefani’s resolution declaring October Domestic Violence Awareness Month passed. The City Hall was lit up in purple. The event was attended by elected officials, department heads, and domestic violence service providers.

#### **IV. Report Out from the FVC Representative to Sentencing Commission**

Jenny Pearlman reported on behalf of Andrew Tan. The last Sentencing Commission meeting was held on September 26, 2023. They received 2 presentations, one of which was from the Salvation Army about their way-out program supporting the unhoused community members. The second presentation was from Just Home Around, a national project to reduce incarceration through supporting unhoused people to find sustainable housing solutions.

#### **V. Report from the Office of the District Attorney Relating to Elder Abuse and Hate Crimes Intersections**

Nancy Tung from the Office of the District Attorney shared that their data showed that there is not much overlap between elder abuse and hate crimes cases. She shared that elder abuse categories can be financial, physical and they may occasionally exhibit elements of hate crimes. It can also encompass aspects of intimate partner violence. It depends on who the perpetrator is. Ms. Tung stated that there may be overlap with other units relative to elder victims such as homicide and major crimes. Out of 550 cases that were filed by the DV Unit in fiscal year 21-22, only 7 of them were elder abuse cases. In fiscal year 22-23, out of 472 total cases, 12 of them were elder abuse cases. Ms. Tung said that there is nothing in the family violence data that can help determine who is committing crimes against elders. She shared that in the Vulnerable Victims Unit, which has been around over a year, most of the cases they file are elder abuse cases. The Unit had one case that had an overlap of elder abuse and hate crimes charged. This was a case of a man in Dolores Park was hurling racial slurs against Asian people and throwing bricks at them. At that time, an elderly Korean woman was there, and he also threw a brick at her. Ms. Tung stated that because of the circumstances the Unit was able to charge a hate crime enhancement as well. Overall, Ms. Tung pointed out it is difficult to charge a person with a hate crime enhancement because there would have to be prior history, or something would have had to be clearly said during the commission of the crime that demonstrates bias.

Esther Leong shared that there has been an increase in financial scams targeting the elderly API population and the banks are not being responsive largely due to language access issues. She asked if the Office of the District Attorney does outreach to the API elder community to educate them about financial scams.

Nancy Tung pointed out that the banks are mandated reporters of financial elder abuse. She added that it is difficult to get people to report a financial scam to the police because of the shame they feel. Ms. Tung acknowledged that there is always outreach that could be done and particularly to the API community. She highlighted that an additional barrier to prosecute these crimes is that the Police Department is the intake area for financial crimes, and they are backlogged in terms of their investigations. Ms. Tung offered to connect with the elder abuse prevention community to talk about community outreach.

## **VI. Update Relating to the FVC Data Collection for the FVC Report**

Kevin Roach reminded that the Department on the Status of Women (DOSW) is collecting 2 years of data from 15 organizations. Data requests went out in late September. The data broadly covers the prevalence and response from the city and the three core areas, child abuse, elder abuse, and domestic violence. Dr. Roach shared that to date 11 organizations responded to the data request: child support services, family and child services, elder abuse forensic center, HSA, District Attorney's Office, Sheriff's Department, Superior Court, Adult Protective Services, Department of Emergency Management, Adult Probation and DOSW. Four organizations have yet to respond: SFPD, Safe and sound, Department of Public Health and SFUSD. Dr. Roach concluded by saying that DOSW plans to preview the analysis at the February FVC meeting.

## **VII. Report Relating to the Commercially Sexually Exploited Children (CSEC) Street Outreach Convening**

Naz Rydhan-Foster with the Department on the Status of Women shared that the goal of the street outreach convening in October was to focus on reengaging youth in services. The convening was organized by DOSW, Legal Services for Children, Safe & Sound and CASA. Other goals included: building relationships with providers and agencies working on youth, homelessness, foster care, juvenile justice, CSEC and street outreach, improved information sharing, and improved and timely engagement with youth experiencing homelessness.

Jen Daly with the Legal Services for Children shared that they wanted to identify youth's needs by convening focus groups with youth who had, when they were under 18, experienced homelessness and were in a foster care placement. The main needs that came up were access to therapy and phones, lower barrier housing, employment, peer navigators, consistent services that are not tied to placement, safe caring adults and warm handoffs between services. Ms. Daly shared that there was a lot of talk about collaboration among teams, avoiding duplication of services and having leads for different types of services. Participants committed to several work groups. Ms. Daly emphasized the importance of bringing street outreach providers into the multi-disciplinary teams for foster youth and one of the work groups will focus on that. The Hype Center agreed to be the location for the drop-in wellness center. A work group will be convened to see which providers can provide wellness services there. Ms. Daly concluded by saying that a report with recommendations is forthcoming.

## VIII. **Key Issues in Family Violence**

- a. Domestic Violence Update – Bev Upton
- b. Elder Abuse Update – Anni Chung
- c. Child Abuse Update – Jenny Pearlman

Bev Upton highlighted October as DV Awareness Month which brought forward events where the community was able to stand together and talk about unity and stability. She thanked everyone who convened, attended, and supported those events. Ms. Upton also shared that there have been several disturbing domestic violence related homicides in the surrounding counties.

Anni Chung offered that moving forward it might be worthwhile considering a joint celebration of DV Awareness Month and Elder Abuse Awareness Day considering that at times there is overlap in families, especially in multi-generational families living under one roof of perpetrating and experiencing different forms of abuse such as DV and elder abuse. Ms. Chung also congratulated Ali Chiu and IOA on 40 years of elder abuse prevention work.

Jenny Pearlman shared that Safe & Sound celebrated its 50th anniversary and the 50th anniversary of the first Child Abuse Prevention Council in California. She reported that there are several bills in the state legislature that Safe & Sound will look at related to unhoused young people, particularly young people who have transitioned out of the foster care system. Ms. Pearlman added that they are also working with HSH and child welfare on revising the Cities Protocol and MOU with respect to sexually exploited young people. She highlighted City's investment in young children's mental health needs which is reflected in the RFP that the Department of Early Childhood and DPH will issue. Ms. Pearlman provided an update on the state task force to reform mandated reporting and stated that it has been launched with 35 members from different sectors and parts of the state. San Francisco's Joan Miller, Deputy Director of Family and Children Services is the Child Welfare representative and Ms. Pearlman is the Family Resource Center representative. The task force is moving toward creating a set of recommendations to the state in multiple areas which will come out in June. Ms. Pearlman reported that there are 5 subcommittees that are working on specific issues, and she is co-chairing the Committee on Legal Liability for Mandated Reporters. Another important update is that the state changed the definition of neglect with respect to mandated reporting and the definition now excludes family's economic disadvantage. The state will announce this soon in an all-county letter which goes out to all county child welfare offices.

**IX. Public Comment**

*This item is to allow members of the public to comment, for a maximum of two minutes each, on matters within the Council's purview, as well as to suggest new agenda items for the Council's future consideration.*

There were no members of the public who asked to address the Council.

**X. Adjourn to February 28, 2024 at 3PM**

The meeting was adjourned to February 28 at 3PM.