



City and County of San Francisco
Department on the Status of Women



London N. Breed
 Mayor

Family Violence Council Meeting Minutes
 February 28, 2024, 3:00 pm – 5:00 pm

I. Call to Order/Roll Call

Seat No.	Seat Designation	Member Present
1	Presiding Judge of the Superior Court or designee	
2	Mayor or designee	Bobby Lopez
3	President of the Board of Supervisors or designee	Dominica Donovan
4	District Attorney or designee	Rebecca Wagner
5	Chief of Police or designee	Antonio Flores, SFPD & Captain O’Brian
6	Sheriff or designee	Delia Ginorio & Lizette Adams
7	President of Commission on the Status of Women or designee	Kimberly Ellis
8	Chief of Adult Probation or designee	Alea Brown-Hoffmeister & Supervisor Nicole Green
9	Executive Director of Department of Emergency Management or designee	
10	Executive Director of Domestic Violence Consortium or designee	Beverly Upton
11	Director of Human Services Agency or designee	Taryn Ness
12	Executive Director of Consortium for Elder Abuse Prevention or designee	Ali Chiu & Anni Chung
13	Executive Director of Safe & Sound, which operates the San Francisco Child Abuse Prevention Council or designee	Janis Connallon
14	Director of the Department of Public Health or designee	Dr. Leigh Kimberg
15	Executive Director of the Department of Adult and Aging Services or designee	Akiles Ceron
16	Executive Director of the Department of Children, Youth & Their Families or designee	
17	Medical Examiner or designee	Dr. Ellen Moffatt
18	Director of the Department of Child Support Services or designee	Karen Roye
19	Chief of Juvenile Probation or designee	Derek Holland
20	Public Defender or designee	
21	Director of the Department of Animal Care and Control or designee	Judy Choi
22	Superintendent of San Francisco Unified School District or designee	

23	Human Resources Director or designee	Tugbenyoh Mawuli
24	Chief of the Fire Department or designee	Matt Alba
25	Director of the Department of Homelessness and Supportive Housing or designee	Jessica Lindquist
26	Director of the Department of Early Childhood or designee	Shelli Rawling-Fein
27	Director of the Department of Police Accountability or designee	Carolyn Wysinger
28	Executive Director of the Human Rights Commission or designee	KellyLou Densmore

II. Consent Agenda/Agenda Changes

Action: To approve the Consent Agenda and any Changes to February 28, 2024 Agenda

Seat No.	Seat Designation	Member Present	Vote
1	Presiding Judge of the Superior Court or designee		
2	Mayor or designee	Bobby Lopez	Y
3	President of the Board of Supervisors or designee	Dominica Donovan	Y
4	District Attorney or designee	Rebecca Wagner	Y
5	Chief of Police or designee	Antonio Flores & Captain O'Brian	Y
6	Sheriff or designee	Delia Ginorio & Adams	Y
7	President of Commission on the Status of Women or designee	Kimberly Ellis	Y
8	Chief of Adult Probation or designee	Alea Brown-Hoffmeister & Supervisor Nicole Greens	Y
9	Executive Director of Department of Emergency Management or designee		
10	Executive Director of Domestic Violence Consortium or designee	Beverly Upton	Y
11	Director of Human Services Agency or designee	Taryn Ness	Y
12	Executive Director of Consortium for Elder Abuse Prevention or designee	Ali Chiu & Anni Chung	Y
13	Executive Director of Safe & Sound, which operates the San Francisco Child Abuse Prevention Council or designee	Janis Connallon	Y
14	Director of the Department of Public Health or designee	Dr. Leigh Kimberg	Y
15	Executive Director of the Department of Adult and Aging Services or designee	Akiles Ceron	Y
16	Executive Director of the Department of Children, Youth & Their Families or designee		Y
17	Medical Examiner or designee	Dr. Ellen Moffatt	Y
18	Director of the Department of Child Support Services or designee	Karen Roye	Y
19	Chief of Juvenile Probation or designee	Derek Holland	Y
20	Public Defender or designee		
21	Director of the Department of Animal Care and Control or designee	Judy Choi	Y

22	Superintendent of San Francisco Unified School District or designee		
23	Human Resources Director or designee	Tugbenyoh Mawuli	Y
24	Chief of the Fire Department or designee	Matt Alba	Y
25	Director of the Department of Homelessness and Supportive Housing or designee	Jessica Lindquist	Y
26	Director of the Department of Early Childhood or designee	Shelli Rawlings Fein	Y
27	Director of the Department of Police Accountability or designee	Carolyn Wysinger	abstain
28	Executive Director of the Human Rights Commission or designee	KellyLou Densmore	Y

Antonio Flores made the motion to approve the consent agenda. Delia Ginorio seconded. The consent agenda passed with 23 in favor.

III. Council Member Check-In

- Beverly Upton, Domestic Violence Consortium and Antonia More, Justice and Diversity Center, voiced concern over the federal Victims of Crime Act (VOCA) cuts. More highlighted how these funding reductions have directly affected their grants and jeopardized essential services, including staff retention.
- More also emphasized the necessity of gathering more data on their community outreach efforts to ensure continued support. Additionally, she underscored the vital role of CBOs noting that two-thirds of calls for assistance during emergencies are directed to CBOs rather than law enforcement.

IV. Report Out from Elected Officials

Update on FVC ordinance and the Office of the Victim & Witness Rights

- Chief of Staff Dominica Donovan, Supervisor Steffanie’s Office, provided the following updates:
 - Following advice from the city attorney's office, efforts are underway to draft legislation extending the FVC sunset date and delegating authority over the FVC to the Mayor’s office.
 - Collaboration with the FVC and DOSW is ongoing to refine these proposed changes, with plans to present an introduction in the coming weeks.
 - Given the challenging budget cycle, united support is crucial to sustain funding for the Office of Victims and Witness Rights and local initiatives aiding victims and survivors of domestic and family violence.
- Beverly Upton, Domestic Violence Consortium, stressed the importance of notifying the council ahead of the legislation introduction to facilitate community support at City Hall.
- Dr. Joseph Macaluso, Department on the Status of Women, highlighted that once finalized, the Office of Victims and Witness Rights will assume the FVC responsibilities.

V. Report Out from the FVC Representative to Sentencing Commission

Andrew Tan, Safe & Sound

- At their last sentencing commission meeting on December 10th, 2023, they welcomed Mia Bird, appointed by the Mayor as a researcher. Mia, a professor at the Goldman School of Public Policy, joined the commission.
- The Safety and Justice Committee provided updates, collaborating with Cal AIM to allocate resources from the MacArthur Foundation and partnering with the Urban Institute for a case study.
- Updates on San Francisco's jail population revealed an increase in bookings coupled with fewer releases compared to the previous December. Additionally, there's been a rise in both bookings and unsheltered individuals in the jail population.

- Moving forward, meetings will shift from Tuesdays to the fourth Thursday of each month. The next meeting is scheduled for March 28th at 10:00 AM.

VI. Presentation on initial findings from the Annual Family Violence Council Report

Kevin Roach, Department on the Status of Women

- Dr. Roach provided preliminary data analysis from the executive summary of the Family Violence Council report, utilizing FY 2023 data, with FY 2022 data to be incorporated into the main report.
- Data sources for the report were collected from various agencies, including Child Support Services, Family & Children’s Services, Elder Abuse Forensic Center, HSA CalWORKS, District Attorney, Sheriff’s Department, Superior Court, Adult Protective Services, Emergency Management, Adult Probation, DOSW (grantee data), SFPD, Safe and Sound, DPH, and SFUSD.
- The complete presentation deck containing the preliminary data analysis is attached to the Feb 28th meeting invite. Below, you'll find the statistics shared for each category: Child Abuse, Elder Abuse, and Domestic Violence.

Child Abuse

Prevalence:

- Child abuse allegations: Family and Children’s Services reported **4,896 (5,230)** child abuse cases.
- Substantiated cases: Family and Children’s Services substantiated **515 or 11% (533 or 10%)** of cases.
- 911 Calls: There were **528 (411)** child abuse related calls to 911.
- Mandated reporting: There were **881 (1788)** reports made by mandated reporters in schools during SY 2023.

System Response:

- Services: **173 (112)** cases served through Safe and Sound Children Advocacy Center.
- Arrests: **248 (253)** arrests made by the San Francisco Police Department.
- Prosecutions: The District Attorney’s Office prosecuted **131 (33)** cases, most cases were for physical or sexual abuse (previously most were child pornography).
- Convictions: **8 (2)** cases resulted in a conviction through trial on at least one count.

Demographics:

- *Demographics of Victims*
 - Race/ethnicity: Latinx (**39%**) and Black/African American (**35%**) children were overrepresented among victims with substantiated allegations, (**39%** and **32%**, respectively).
 - Gender: Girls experienced child abuse at a higher rate (**51%**) than boys (**49%**). Boys more frequently experienced caretaker absence or incapacity. Girls more frequently experienced sexual abuse (**52%** and **48%** respectively).
- *Demographics of Perpetrators*
 - Gender: Men represented the **75% (68%)** of child abuse suspects.
 - Relationship to victim: **93% (91%)** of perpetrators were parents or stepparents of the victim.

CA: Highlights:

- Decrease in the number of reports to mandated reporters.
- Large increase in the number of prosecutions by the DA.
- Over representation of Black and Latinx victims.

Elder Abuse

Prevalence

- Reports of elder and dependent adult abuse: **57%** of reports (**4,756 of 8,327**) were substantiated (**54%**, **3,911 of 7,204**).
- Self-neglect cases: There was a total of **2,261 (2,472)** substantiated elder abuse self-neglect cases.
- 911 Calls: There were **118* (162)** elder abuse related calls to 911.
**Waiting for additional codes*

System Response

- System response to elder physical abuse cases: **532 (448)** elder abuse incidents were reported to the Police Department.
- System response to elder financial abuse cases: **34 (38)** elder financial abuse incidents were reported to the Police Department.
- Arrests: **200 (188)** arrests were made in elder physical abuse cases.
- Prosecutions: **12 (10)** arrests were made in elder physical abuse cases.

Demographics

- *Demographics of Victims*
 - Race/ethnicity: The Black/African American community was overrepresented among victims of abuse by others, representing **17% (16%)** of elder abuse victims and **28% (28%)** of dependent adult abuse victims. AAPI individuals were **28% (13%)** of elder abuse victims.
 - Gender: Women comprised a **57%** share of total victims of elder abuse (**54%**).
- *Demographics of Perpetrators*
 - Gender: Men represented **75%** of total elder abuse suspects (**68%**).
 - Relationship to victim: **94%** of victims knew the perpetrator. **76%** of victims were abused by a family member* (**86% and 43%** respectively).
**Large Percentage of this data is NA*

EA: Highlights

- Increase in the number of elder abuse cases with roughly the same substantiation rate.
- Less racial/ethnic disparity in victimization, but still over representation of Black and Latinx victims.
- Increase in the percent of cases for AAPI victims (though still underrepresented).

Domestic Violence

Prevalence

- Incidents reported to Police: **3,330 (3,379)** incidents were reported to the police, **3,148 (2,288)** investigated by SVU.
- 911 Calls: **49%** or **3,281** of the **6,658 (56% or 4,019 of 7,241)** domestic violence related 911 calls concerned a fight or dispute where no weapons were used.
- Weapons used: **2,859 (2,827)** domestic violence incidents reported to the police involved a weapon.

System Response

- Assistance Provided: **13,436 (14,501)** individuals served through DOSW funded grants.
- Prosecutions: **42%** or **492** of **1,167** total cases received by the District Attorney's Office were prosecuted (**34%** or **543** of **1,587**).
- Convictions: **4** of **14 (7 of 8)** cases resulted in a conviction by trial.
- Restraining Orders: The Family Law Division of the San Francisco Superior Court received **845**

(825) requests for domestic violence restraining orders and granted 65% of 246 requests (74% or 292).

Demographics

- *Demographics of Victims*
 - Race/ethnicity: The Black/African American (31%) and Latinx communities (32%) were overrepresented among victims (29% and 27%, respectively).
 - Languages Spoken: 25% or 3,370 of 13,436 individuals served by the Gender-Based Violence Prevention and Intervention Grants Program spoke a language other than English (25% or 3,689 of 14,501).
 - Gender: Female victims made up 71% (70%) of Police Department incidents.
 - Age: Victims between the ages of 18 and 39 years of age represented 55% (54%) of Police incidents.

- *Perpetrators*
 - Gender: Men represented 79% (78%) of suspects.
 - Age: 62% (60%) of suspects were between the ages of 18 and 39.

DV: Highlights:

- Increase in the number of cases investigated by SVSU.
- Increase in the rate of prosecution.
- Over representation of Black and Latinx victims.

What's Next?

- The main report will comprehensively examine all the data received.
- Analysis will examine trends over time, population comparisons, and group comparisons.
- Main report will include FY 2022 data as well as data from previous reports.

Discussion/Q&A

Shelli Rawlings-Fein, Department of Early Childhood

Question1: Are the children represented primarily in the 0-5 age group or are they mostly school-aged?

Response: The data is categorized into three age groups: 0-5; 6-10; 11-17. Approximately half fall into the 11-17 category, with a quarter falling into each of the 5-10 and 0-5 age ranges. This information is sourced from family and children services data.

Question2: With the pandemic easing, are there national trends in abuse rates across these three areas, and how do we compare?

Response: Reporting challenges significantly impact data accuracy. While data can provide insight, reliability varies. For instance, in cases of domestic violence, individuals may not report if sheltering in place with an abuser. This reporting dynamic hinders our ability to accurately compare trends nationally.

Beverly Upton, Domestic Violence Consortium

Comments:

- Upton applauded the incorporation of community data into system responses for enhanced authenticity.
- Appreciated SUV for their diligent investigation of additional cases.
- Commended the community Domestic violence services for providing essential language access.
- Acknowledged the challenges faced by the AAPI community, including language barriers and elder abuse, and the overrepresentation of Black and Latinx communities, signaling the need for action.

- Emphasized the pivotal role of the community as non-profit organizations often receive three times as many calls as law enforcement due to their ability to provide confidentiality, language proficiency, and cultural understanding.
- Upton also inquired about the timeline for finalizing the full report. DOSW expects the full report to be ready for presentation at the next FVC meeting in May.

Antonio Flores, SFDP

Question: How were the restraining orders analyzed? Were they categorized as emergency protective orders, temporary restraining orders, or related to gun violence, or were they combined?

Responses:

- The data from the sheriff's department, particularly regarding the interaction of guns with restraining orders, is still pending. As per my understanding, if there is a restraining order, the firearm should be seized or surrendered.
- We will follow up on this question after conducting further research.

Comments:

- Considering that our agency, the SFPD, predominantly deals with emergency protective orders, it's essential to understand how these are tallied, alongside gun restraining order violence, which constitutes another category. If the data is solely sourced from the Sheriff's department, the numbers might appear lower. However, incorporating data from other sources could yield different results.
- During discussions amid the pandemic, it was anticipated that these numbers would decrease due to the pandemic's effects. However, with the onset of civil unrest, we observed a surge in numbers. It would be beneficial if the report addresses how external events influence the fluctuation of these numbers.

Ester Leong, Asian Pacific Islander Legal Outreach

- Leong highlighted the minimal change despite rising reports and prosecutions, emphasizing the need for further efforts to identify underlying gaps.

VII. Key Issues in Family Violence

- a. Domestic Violence Update – Bev Upton
- b. Elder Abuse Update – Anni Chung
- c. Child Abuse Update – Jenny Pearlman

Domestic Violence Update – Bev Upton

- Despite overall decreases in homicides, we mourn the tragic case of Kimberly Wong and appreciate the DA's handling, including victim services.
- Thanks to service providers and community advocates for their tireless support, keeping shelters and crisis lines open.
- Budget cuts pose challenges, but we're dedicated to collaborating with the Mayor's office, BOS, and DOSW to navigate through.
- The political landscape regarding women's rights and gender-based violence is shifting, evidenced by significant cuts in VOCA funding.

Elder Abuse Update – Anni Chung

Anni Chung, Self Help for the Elderly

- The Blessings Scams, a recurring issue in the SF community over the past decade, have resurfaced. SFPD and the DA's office are collaborating closely with the community to combat these crimes.
- The scams primarily target Cantonese-speaking elderly females, with four reported cases in SF thus far. Caution AAPI elderly friends and family against engaging with strangers and to refrain from

surrendering jewelry and cash to them.

- Planning for World Elder Abuse Awareness Day (WEAAD) on June 14th at City Hall is underway, likely featuring a press conference or similar event with a campaign. Additionally, a series of workshops will be held to educate and prevent financial abuse and scams.

Antonio Flores, SFPD

- Currently, three types of scams are prevalent:
 - Blessings scams: supposedly to expel evil spirits.
 - Pig-butcherer: individuals are approached, often via WeChat, with promises of lucrative cryptocurrency investments.
 - Construction roofing scam: targeting elders, particularly in the Richmond and Taraval districts, for roof repairs.
- These scams exploit trust within the community, making victims less likely to suspect harm from familiar faces.
- Victims often feel ashamed for falling prey to these scams, emphasizing the importance of raising awareness within the AAIP community.

Ali Chiu, Institute on Aging

- Planning workshops to raise awareness about these scams before the June 14th event. The first workshop is scheduled for March 26th at 11am at the San Francisco Library. Seeking partners from SFPD and other organizations to address these concerns.

Ester Leong, Asian Pacific Islander Legal Outreach

- In November's meeting, we highlighted elder financial abuse as a critical area of focus. We're deeply concerned about banking-related fraud and scams and are actively partnering with financial institutions to implement stronger preventive measures.
- We plan to launch a campaign addressing this issue. It's unacceptable that individuals are losing their life savings.
- Collaboration with law enforcement, communities, and families is essential to halt these crimes, acknowledging that this effort will take time.

Child Abuse Update – Jenny Pearlman

Pearlman was not present during the meeting but shared the following updates over email:

- This week the Family Services Alliance (Formerly the Family Resource Center Alliance and the Family Support Network) are hosting a week where policymakers and elected officials participated in activities at the various family support centers across the City. We have scheduled about 15 different events that members of the Board of Supervisors and the Child and Family Commission have attended.
- The All County Letter on implementation of AB 2085 and SB 1085– which change the definition of neglect to exclude parents' economic disadvantage–came out at the end of December. Safe & Sound is cited in the Letter and provided comments. Counties are now taking action to follow this, such as changing mandated reporter training to include this new information. The Child Abuse Prevention Council is working on this in San Francisco, and LA County has been working with UCLA and Safe & Sound on creating a very detailed new training on the new approach relating to the changes in the definition of neglect.
- Senator Min is sponsoring SB 1126 related to domestic violence and child abuse. It would provide that (1) a child witnessing domestic violence is not a sufficient basis for reporting child abuse or neglect, and that (2) the definition of child abuse or neglect does not apply to how a child witnessing domestic violence or residing in a household where domestic violence exists may be relevant to, among other things, a determination of child custody or visitation. This bill has some

elements of what the Domestic Violence Coalition and SFPD worked on many years ago.

- Members of San Francisco’s Child Death Review Team—including Dr. Moffat from the Medical Examiner’s Office and Ronda Johnson from FCS are participating in a new statewide Child Death Review Coalition to share information, improve Child Death Review teams and reporting and address statewide issues.

VIII. Public Comment

This item is to allow members of the public to comment, for a maximum of two minutes each, on matters within the Council’s purview, as well as to suggest new agenda items for the Council’s future consideration.

There were no public comments.

IX. Adjourn to May 22, 2024 at 3PM

The meeting concluded at 4:23 PM, with the next session adjourned to May 22, 2024, at 3:00 PM