



City and County of San Francisco
Department on the Status of Women



London N. Breed
 Mayor

Family Violence Council Meeting Minutes
 May 22, 2024, 3:00 pm – 5:00 pm

I. Call to Order/Roll Call

Seat No.	Seat Designation	Member Present
1	Presiding Judge of the Superior Court or designee	
2	Mayor or designee	Bobbi Lopez
3	President of the Board of Supervisors or designee	Supervisor Stefani
4	District Attorney or designee	David Merin, Rebecca Wagner
5	Chief of Police or designee	Alexa O’Brian, Deputy Chief O’Sullivan
6	Sheriff or designee	Catherine Johnson
7	President of Commission on the Status of Women or designee	Kimberly Ellis
8	Chief of Adult Probation or designee	Adela Martinez
9	Executive Director of Department of Emergency Management or designee	Evora Heard
10	Executive Director of Domestic Violence Consortium or designee	Beverly Upton
11	Director of Human Services Agency or designee	Susie Smith
12	Executive Director of Consortium for Elder Abuse Prevention or designee	Ali Chiu, Anni Chung
13	Executive Director of Safe & Sound, which operates the San Francisco Child Abuse Prevention Council or designee	Jenny Pearlman
14	Director of the Department of Public Health or designee	Dr. Leigh Kimberg
15	Executive Director of the Department of Adult and Aging Services or designee	Akiles Ceron
16	Executive Director of the Department of Children, Youth & Their Families or designee	
17	Medical Examiner or designee	Dr. Ellen Moffatt
18	Director of the Department of Child Support Services or designee	Lisa Saporito
19	Chief of Juvenile Probation or designee	Derek Hom
20	Public Defender or designee	
21	Director of the Department of Animal Care and Control or designee	
22	Superintendent of San Francisco Unified School District or designee	

23	Human Resources Director or designee	Mawuli Tugbenyoh
24	Chief of the Fire Department or designee	Matt Alba
25	Director of the Department of Homelessness and Supportive Housing or designee	Elisabet Avalos
26	Director of the Department of Early Childhood or designee	Shelli Rawling-Fein
27	Director of the Department of Police Accountability or designee	Carolyn Wysinger
28	Executive Director of the Human Rights Commission or designee	Dulce Garcia

The meeting was called to order at 3:03PM. Quorum was established with 23 members present.

II. Consent Agenda/Agenda Changes

Action: To approve the Consent Agenda and any Changes to February 28, 2024 Agenda

Seat No.	Seat Designation	Member Present	Vote
1	Presiding Judge of the Superior Court or designee		
2	Mayor or designee	Bobbi Lopez	Y
3	President of the Board of Supervisors or designee	Supervisor Stefani	Y
4	District Attorney or designee	David Merin, Rebecca Wagner	Y
5	Chief of Police or designee	Alexa O'Brian, Deputy Chief O'Sullivan	Y
6	Sheriff or designee	Catherine Johnson	Y
7	President of Commission on the Status of Women or designee	Kimberly Ellis	Y
8	Chief of Adult Probation or designee	Adela Martinez	Y
9	Executive Director of Department of Emergency Management or designee	Evora Heard	Y
10	Executive Director of Domestic Violence Consortium or designee	Beverly Upton	Y
11	Director of Human Services Agency or designee	Susie Smith	Y
12	Executive Director of Consortium for Elder Abuse Prevention or designee	Ali Chiu, Anni Chung	Y
13	Executive Director of Safe & Sound, which operates the San Francisco Child Abuse Prevention Council or designee	Jenny Pearlman	Y
14	Director of the Department of Public Health or designee	Dr. Leigh Kimberg	Y
15	Executive Director of the Department of Adult and Aging Services or designee	Akiles Ceron	No vote
16	Executive Director of the Department of Children, Youth & Their Families or designee		
17	Medical Examiner or designee	Dr. Ellen Moffatt	Y
18	Director of the Department of Child Support Services or designee	Lisa Saporito	Y
19	Chief of Juvenile Probation or designee	Derek Hom	Y
20	Public Defender or designee		
21	Director of the Department of Animal Care and Control or designee		

22	Superintendent of San Francisco Unified School District or designee		
23	Human Resources Director or designee	Mawuli Tugbenyoh	Y
24	Chief of the Fire Department or designee	Matt Alba	Y
25	Director of the Department of Homelessness and Supportive Housing or designee	Elisabet Avalos	Y
26	Director of the Department of Early Childhood or designee	Shelli Rawling-Fein	Y
27	Director of the Department of Police Accountability or designee	Carolyn Wysinger	Y
28	Executive Director of the Human Rights Commission or designee	Dulce Garcia	Y

Beverly Upton made the motion to approve the consent agenda. Shelli Rawling-Fein seconded. The consent agenda passed with 22 in favor.

III. Council Member Check-In

- Beverly Upton, representing the San Francisco Domestic Violence Consortium, spoke about the tragic loss of Michelle Henry, a transgender woman in San Francisco. She underscored the importance of unity and acknowledged the profound impact on diverse communities.
- Ali Chiu, from Elder Abuse Prevention, highlighted the upcoming World Elder Abuse Awareness Day campaign. She mentioned plans for a press conference on the 14th, which will include workshops addressing Elder Financial Abuse within the community.

IV. Report Out from the Office of Supervisor Stefani

- Supervisor Stephani introduced a new ordinance designed to prohibit law enforcement agencies from purchasing firearms and ammunition from dealers who have violated ATF regulations. The ordinance guarantees that city funds are exclusively allocated to vendors in compliance with federal firearms laws.
- Currently, 90 law enforcement agencies in California collectively spend \$20 million on firearms and ammunition, conducting business with six federally licensed firearm dealers who have violated firearms regulations.
- The ordinance was unanimously passed by the Board of Supervisors.

V. Update on Proposition D

- Bobbi Lopez updated progress on establishing the Office of Victims and Witness Rights, emphasizing ongoing collaboration with the city attorney's office to address victim needs and privacy concerns.
- Proposition D established a dedicated office for crime victims' rights in San Francisco, tasked with conducting a comprehensive survey of victims' needs.
- The survey, conducted through interviews with 62 community-based organizations (CBOs), 10 Board of Supervisors (BOS) members, and 7 city departments, focused on ensuring geographical, racial, ethnic, gender, and age diversity. It aimed to assess the adequacy and effectiveness of victim support services from the perspective of crime victims.
- Key findings from the survey identified five primary challenges:
 - 1) Navigating the criminal justice system presents significant challenges and can retraumatize victims:
 - Issues with understanding and enforcement of Marsy's Law rights
 - Inadequate communication and systemic problem-solving

- 2) Lack of relocation and housing options:
 - Essential for victim safety and stability
 - Need for diverse housing solutions
- 3) Unmet emotional and mental health support needs:
 - Insufficient mental health services
 - Need for trauma-informed and culturally appropriate services
- 4) Emergency financial relief is crucial after a traumatic event, particularly violent ones, but current support systems are often inflexible, reimbursement-based, or limited in their adaptability to individual circumstances:
 - Insufficient safety nets
 - Providing direct financial support to survivors is critical
- 5) The demanding nature of supporting individuals who have experienced victimization takes a toll on the well-being of support personnel:
 - High stress and vicarious trauma
 - Need for systemic support and safe spaces
- Role of the Office:
 - Policy-making: Identifying and addressing systemic gaps.
 - Advocacy: Increasing fiscal and structural resources and improving support systems.
 - Convening: Collaborating with various councils and boards.
- The office will review stakeholder recommendations to determine sustainable implementation on a year-to-year basis.
- The full report will be released soon.

Q&A: Discussion

Q: Elisabet Avalos (HSH): Were there any equity analyses conducted to show disproportionate impacts among different identity groups in the study?

- Response: Yes, the analysis covered Trans, LGBTQ, Latinx, Pacific Islander, and intersections with Trans identities. It also assessed geographically-based needs in Bayview, Hunters Point, and Tenderloin, where requests for basic needs and crisis support are high.

Q: Jill Zawisza (Woman Inc): When will the Victim Advisory Board/committee for the office be operational? How do we keep the communication line with the office open?

- Response: The conversation is preliminary and ongoing. Continuous updates on Prop D, informed by stakeholders and the community, will be necessary.

Q: Jenny Pearlman (Safe & Sound): How are you going to prioritize the feedback and recommendations from stakeholders?

- Response: Prioritization will depend on feasibility over Year 1, 2, and 3, guided by the advisory board. Establishing the office will be a year-long process and will require ongoing work.

VI. Update on Annual Family Violence Council Report

Alfredo Huante, Department on the Status of Women

- The full draft of the 2022-2023 Family Violence Council Report is ready and has been sent to data partners for review, with most feedback received.
- The draft report will be shared with everyone for broader feedback, with highlighted sections in the

- PDF indicating areas needing comments, particularly in narrative sections.
- The next stage involves completing the review by Family Violence Council members and integrating their feedback, along with broader feedback and recommendations.

VII. Report Out from the FVC Representative to Sentencing Commission

Andrew Tan, Safe & Sound

- The last meeting of the sentencing commission was on March 28, 2024.
- They received a presentation from the Just Home Initiative about the disproportionate impacts of homelessness, structural racism, and discrimination on the African American community in San Francisco.
- The presentation revealed that 66% of homeless individuals self-reported mental health symptoms, and 49% were not on their leases before becoming homeless.
- Recommendations included increased access to mental health and substance use services. Updates on the Safety and Justice Training Supporting Group and jail population trends were also provided.
- The next meeting is on June 27, 2024.

VIII. Key Issues in Family Violence

- Domestic Violence Update – Bev Upton
- Elder Abuse Update – Anni Chung
- Child Abuse Update – Jenny Pearlman

Domestic Violence Update – Bev Upton

- Upton discussed the impact of federal VOCA (Victim of Crime Act) cuts, highlighting a 40% reduction in federal funding and a \$200 million deficit in California. She mentioned efforts by California legislators to fill the gap in the state budget. The total impact on San Francisco is unknown but estimated to be over \$10 million.
- Upton emphasized the critical role of VOCA funds for non-profits, shelters, crisis lines, and law enforcement, expressing concern about maintaining services for survivors of gender-based violence.
- Upton announced a rally in San Jose on May 31st to address the VOCA cuts, with leaders from Santa Clara County participating.
- Upton expressed gratitude to Bobbi and optimism about Prop D's future impact.
- Jill Zawisza from Women Inc. shared concerns about the impact of VOCA cuts on their safety network and the broader implications for homelessness and crime. She urged advocacy and organizing to address the funding gap.

Elder Abuse Update – Anni Chung

- Chung provided updates on World Elder Abuse Awareness Day events: an ethnic media roundtable on June 6, a press conference on June 14, and a virtual walk-a-thon on June 15.
- The theme this year is "Can the Scams" due to rising financial abuse in the city.
- Speakers at the roundtable include an FBI special agent, an attorney for scam victims, SFPD's Sergeant Flores, and representatives from HSA.
- Attorney General Bonta or his Chief of Staff will speak at the press conference, with other officials like Carmen Chu and Joaquin Torres.
- City Hall will be lit in purple on June 14 and 15 to commemorate the day.
- The walk-a-thon will be virtual, making it accessible for all.
- Ali Chiu reported community workshops on financial scams have reached over 900 people since mid-March.

Child Abuse Update – Jenny Pearlman

- Pearlman discussed the impact of budget cuts on child abuse prevention and support services, including cuts to VOCA, child advocacy centers, foster care, child tax credit, and funding for basic needs like diapers. She also mentioned an increase in referrals from SFUSD regarding young people

being trafficked.

- Pearlman highlighted activities during April's Child Abuse Prevention Month, including visits by the Board of Supervisors to family support organizations and the publication of a report on the economics of child abuse.
- Pearlman mentioned that the Prevention and Early Intervention Committee approved bold recommendations from the Mandated Reporting Committee Supporting Task Force, which will be reviewed by the Child Welfare Council.
- Pearlman shared that HSA and FCS have a pilot program providing monthly funds to young people who have aged out of the child welfare system.
- Pearlman discussed the implementation of Family First Prevention Services, including referrals to community agencies and family resource centers for supportive services.

IX. Public Comment

There were no public comments.

X. Adjournment

The meeting concluded at 4:26 PM, with the next session adjourned to August 21, 2024, at 3:00 PM