



City and County of San Francisco



# Department on the Status of Women

London N. Breed Kimberly Ellis Mayor Director

## Family Violence Council Meeting Minutes

Wednesday, May 17, 2023

3:00 pm - 5:00 pm

### **Members Present:**

*Presiding Judge of the Superior Court or designee:*

*Mayor or designee: Ivy Lee*

*President of the Board of Supervisors or designee:*

*District Attorney or designee: Rebecca Wagner*

*Chief of Police or designee: Tony Flores; Raj Vaswani; Cmdr Peter Walsh; Sean Perdomo; and Christopher Del Gandio*

*Sheriff or designee: Michele Fisher; Delia Ginorio*

*Chief of the Fire Department or designee: Michael Mason; Chelsea Meyers; and April Sloan*

*Chief of Adult Probation or designee: Chauncey Robinson*

*President of Commission on the Status of Women or designee: Kimberly Ellis*

*Executive Director of Department of Emergency Management or designee: Evora Heard*

*Executive Director of Domestic Violence Consortium or designee: Beverly Upton*

*Director of Human Services Agency or designee: Joan Miller and Jill Nielsen*

*Executive Director of Consortium for Elder Abuse Prevention or designee:*

*Director of San Francisco Child Abuse Council or designee: Jenny Pearlman*

*Director of the Department of Public Health or designee: Dr. Leigh Kimberg*

*Director of Department of Disability and Aging Services or designee: AkilesCeron*

*Medical Examiner or designee: Dr. Ellen Moffatt*

*Director of Department of Child Support Services or designee: Karen Roye,*

*Rita Randolph; Marina Marski*

*Chief of Juvenile Probation or designee: Gabe Calvillo*

*Public Defender or designee: Klay Hathaway; Mark Jacobs*

*Director of Department of Animal Care and Control or designee:*

*Superintendent of San Francisco Unified School District or designee:*

*Executive Director of First 5 San Francisco or designee: Shelli Rawlings-Fein*

*Director of the Department of Homelessness and Supportive Housing or designee: Genevieve Herrera*

### **Others Present:**

*Anni Chung (Self-Help for the Elderly); Dulce Garcia (HRC); Fredo Randolph (CSS); Mia Ragent (Bay Area Legal Aid); Janis Connallon (Safe & Sound); Sam Logan (BOS); Lauren Marcic (UCSF); Freda Randolph (CSS); Judy Choy (ADM); Kelly Lou Densmore (HRC); Jill Zawisza (W.O.M.A.N, Inc.); April McGill (California Consortium for Urban Indian Health); Ester Leong (APILO); Akiko Takeshita, Managing Attorney at Asian Pacific Islander Legal outreach; Kali Shebi, Alea Brown, Kevin Roach, and Alek Hartwick (DOSW)*

### **I. Call to Order/Agenda Changes**

Interim Family Violence Council Tri-Chair Bev Upton calls the meeting to order at 3:03 pm.

### **II. Consent Agenda**

Motion to approve minutes for the February 15, 2023 meeting. Motion by Tony Flores;  
Seconded by Rebecca Wagner.

### **III. FVC Data Dashboard Presentation**

Kevin Roach, DOSW, and ShelterTech provided an overview of the data dashboard they created using data collected from Fiscal Year 2020-2021.

### **IV. FVC Recommendations & Adoption**

The FVC tri-chairs presented the FVC recommendations for discussion.

Jenny Pearlman noted that the process was abbreviated compared to previous years, where data was collected and recommendations created in conjunction with that data.

For this report, the Chairs and community partners reviewed and built on recommendations from prior years and created a high-level recommendations. DOSW created the data dashboard.

FVC will set up meetings with law enforcement and other appropriate departments that FVC is working with on recommendations, particularly with respect to determining progress made on recommendations from prior years.

During the discussion, questions were raised regarding the dashboard—e.g., arrest rates and prosecutions, and there was a desire to dig deeper. The FVC also discussed moving away from a sole focus on intervention and, instead, moving towards more efforts at prevention. There was a suggestion to review arrest rates and demographics in the next report. Recommendation #2 should include the victim and perpetrator: age, language, race, ethnicity, gender, and disability.

**Jill Zawissza**, WOMEN's Inc. raised concerns about calls from Women's Inc not being included (1100 calls this year). She suggested a further conversation on the intersection between intervention and prevention as well as community response so we can include as much nuance as possible.

**Esther Leong** noted that in AAPI culture, there are limitations on reporting and barriers—e.g., someone is 80 yrs old and relying on a family member that is engaging in the abuse. Targeted activities are needed due to residual fear with reporting following COVID. "Just because we don't say it doesn't happen, it doesn't mean it's not happening."

**Bev Upton** noted that interpreters were needed because it is hard to get survivor statements into court due to language challenges.

**Akiko Takeshita** mentioned that the language issue is prevalent with elder abuse. There are cultural differences here. There is an immigrant standard approach to these situations. They report only if someone is possibly going to be killed. Anything less severe is handled within the family. We need an education and prevention focus due to cultural differences that limit outreach to police. The perpetrator is sometimes a family member. When police involvement is brought up, victims back off their statements. There is concern about being judged as a bad parent, etc. The priority is making bad acts stop so the family can remain intact. Data points determine how they are going to deliver services. If police are called, it's usually by a neighbor.

**Kimberly Ellis** stated that distilling down the data to get a clear picture to determine what is happening is essential. What struck her most was the numbers (11,000 shared by JZ). She raised the question of finding out if those are unique callers—how many are from San Francisco or other

parts of California or the United States?

**Consensus:**

Vote on recommendations 1, 3, and 4 as written.

Recommendation 2 is approved contingent on including data regarding demographics related to perpetrators and victims: age, language, race, ethnicity, gender, and any disability. The FVC also noted that going forward, it is important to explore all the tools to get a full assessment, including community organization response/calls, such as the local homeless housing board.

Motion to vote on recommendations by Shelli Rawlings-Fein; Second provided by Anni Chung.

**Vote on Recommendations:**

<b>Member Agency</b>	<b>Vote</b>
Presiding Judge of the Superior Court or designee	
Mayor or designee	Y
President of the Board of Supervisors or designee	

<b>Member Agency</b>	<b>Vote</b>
District Attorney or designee	Y
Chief of Police or designee	Y
Sheriff or designee	Y
President of Commission on the Status of Women or designee	Y
Chief of Adult Probation or designee	Y
Executive Director of Department of Emergency Management or designee	
Executive Director of Domestic Violence Consortium or designee	Y
Director of Human Services Agency or designee	
Executive Director of Consortium for Elder Abuse Prevention or designee	Y

Director of the Department of Homelessness and Supportive Housing or designee	Y
Director of San Francisco Child Abuse Council or designee	Y
Director of the Department of Public Health or designee	
Director of Department of Disability and Aging Services	Y

3

Director of Department of Children, Youth, and Their Families or designee	Y
Medical Examiner or designee	Y
Director of Department of Child Support Services or designee	Y
Chief of Juvenile Probation or designee	
Public Defender or designee	

<b>Member Agency</b>	<b>Vote</b>
Director of Department of Animal Care and Control or designee	
Superintendent of San Francisco Unified School District or designee	
Human Resources Director or designee	
Chief of the Fire Department or designee	Y
Executive Director of First 5 San Francisco or designee	Y
Director of Human Rights Commission or designee	Y
Director of Department of Police Accountability or Designee	

## V. Community Needs Assessment

Elisabet Avalos, Senior Program Manager, Homelessness & Supportive Housing (HSH) shared findings from the community needs assessment, CNA for Survivors of Violence, recently completed by HSH. This started in 2021. Partnered with Homebase and Housing Alliance.

Survivor needs are poorly met by coordinated entry. There is an increased need for multiple housing options. Survivors reported difficulty maintaining housing—obstacles included being undocumented, no pets allowed, and poor credit.

Even with a subsidy, individuals that are victims of financial abuse frequently run into problems due to low credit scores and landlords lacking sympathy.

Recommendations:

- Improve cross-system collaboration
- Provide survivors with meaningful participation in the housing arena;
- Offer training on available needs for system providers;
- Develop information that is easily accessible and available—so no longer forced to call multiple numbers trying to locate beds for survivors;
- Better coordination is needed among resources,
- Access points need training on providing trauma-informed reporting for families, youth and adults.

## VI. Key Issues in Family Violence

- A. Child Abuse Update—Jenny Pearlman
- B. Domestic Violence Update – Bev Upton
- C. Elder Abuse Update – Anni Chung

**Jenny Pearlman.** The Families First Prevention Services Act (FFPSA) designates that child welfare funding may be used for prevention services; each state, as well as counties in California, must opt in and create a plan. California has 49 counties opting in. San Francisco was one of the first to submit, and our plan just got approved. This is a result of an enormous effort with HSA, DEC, DCYF, Juvenile Probation, and many community organizations. It sets us up to focus on prevention. By offering families prevention-focused services, we can divert them from coming into contact with child welfare and offer support through community services.

Money and funding go to the community to support the new system and provide families with new evidence-based practices offered by community agencies. We are developing with multiple city agencies and organizations, a community pathway—every community door is an open door, and families can be connected to a variety of family services. It is important that families are offered services. San Francisco will create a new system so that families can be followed, outside of child welfare tracking, to make sure they receive services. There will be five community organizations that will serve as pilots.

**Mandatory Reporting:** Reform is needed to support families to decrease contact with child welfare. Safe & Sound issued a brief on reforming mandated reporting. The state has taken these recommendations along with others and approved a task force to address changes to mandated reporting. To start in July—change fear-based reporting to community supported system. This is also building on the legislation last year that takes poverty out of the definition of neglect in mandated reporting law. Los Angeles County passed a resolution to do their own work around mandatory reporting and reform it.

There will be a rally on 5/24 at 11 am on the City Hall steps with community members and families to highlight the need to continue the investment in family service organizations to rebuild the City. BOS Safai will speak at the rally.

**Bev Upton.** We are thankful and grateful for Fawn Jade Korr's service. Currently, we are looking for a new co-chair to represent the domestic violence service organization community with plans to have a new name by the next meeting in August. Additionally, there was an increase in survivor contact following the pandemic.

Death Panel Review—There will be a report and press release soon. Shout out to Alek with DOSW. There were lessons learned from one tragic death, but it will benefit all survivors with recommendations that will come out of this report.

**Anni Chung.** Noted that Ali Chiu, Esther Long, and Akiko will assist in incorporating findings into the upcoming report and want to provide survivors an opportunity to comment further.

**Annual Elder Abuse Awareness Day** — June 15th. Social media campaign + walk-a-thon last year. Invitations to departments will arrive shortly. Starting tomorrow, there will be a launch of a 6-week education series that begins on 5/18.

#### **VII. Public Comment**

Family Violence Council Tri-Chair Anni Chung opens for public comment.

#### **VIII. Adjournment**

Motion to adjourn meeting by Tony Flores; seconded by Delia Ginorio. Adjourned at 4:51 pm.

